



CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION



MEETING MINUTES

June 20, 2024

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on June 20th, 2024, at 9:30 a.m. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center Building. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m.. Administrative Support Specialist Shelby Ogle called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Committee.

Roll Call: Shelby Ogle called the roll.

Members Present: Skip Pond, John Brennan, Nathan Bird, Clif McCormick, Dana Moody, Matt McDonald, Todd Morgan

Members Absent: Piper Stromatt

Staff Members Present: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline, Admin Support Shelby Ogle, and Staff Attorney Andrew Trundle

Swearing In: Shelby Ogle swore in people addressing the Committee.

Applicant(s) Present: Keith Riley, Ken and Caroliegh Jouns, Keith Owens, Rachel Shannon, Anna Turner, Jesus Lopez, Francarco P.

Rules and Regulations: Chair Skip Pond explained the rules and procedures, order of business, and announced the meeting is being recorded.

Approve Minutes: Chair Skip Pond presented the May Minutes to be voted on. No amendments need to be made.

John Brennan made a motion to **APPROVE** the May Minutes. **Clif McCormick** seconded the motion. **All in favor.**

The motion carries 7-0.

Staff Review Cases: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the Staff Review cases to the Commission.

- **HZ-24-44:** 4620 St. Elmo Ave. - Rear Wooden Stair
- **HZ-24-51:** 4700 Florida Ave. - Sidewalk Repair + Replacement
- **HZ-24-52:** 4916 Florida Ave. - 6' Privacy Fence
- **HZ-24-53:** 5415 Tennessee Ave. - 6' Privacy Fence
- **HZ-24-54:** 5600 Alabama Ave. - Replace Carport Shingle Roof
- **HZ-24-61:** 5415 Tennessee Ave. - Storm Windows

OLD BUSINESS

- HZ-23-139 - 5413 Alabama Ave. - New Construction

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered: 6.22 New Construction, Pg 52, 6.9 Driveways and Paving, Pg 41

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Keith Riley of 5413 Alabama Ave presented to the Commission that when the case was first presented, the Commission was concerned about the width of the house and so they went back and adjusted the design with several changes to match the neighboring houses better. The Applicant stated some specific changes that were made to the design such as; stucco panels, garage windows, and retaining wall to be stucco and not stone.

Community Response: No community comments or discussion.

Applicant Response to Community: No response needed.

Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote: The Commission asked the Applicant if the parking was planned to be on the side and the Applicant stated that due to the topography of the lot, parking on the side was the only option. The Commission then discussed that they were mostly concerned about the size of the house in comparison to the rest of the neighborhood. They also discussed that due to the topography of the area, the house will sit higher than the rest of the other houses regardless of the height of the house. The Commission then asked the Applicant various questions in regards to material choices for the house such as; concern over the stucco sheets and obvious seams, as well as if the Applicant planned to use vinyl windows (The Applicant plans to use vinyl composite windows that match other windows in the area). In response to concern over the height and setbacks of the house, the Applicant stated that the property is a Lot of Record.

- **Todd Morgan** made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-23-139 - 5413 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:
 - Vinyl composite windows to be approved by Staff.
 - Existing stone retaining wall and posts at driveway entrance to remain and be repaired in kind if needed.

Matt McDonald seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

NEW BUSINESS

Todd Morgan stepped out of the meeting at 10:05 a.m..

Still Have Quorum

HZ-24-20 - 4904 Florida Ave. - Accessory Dwelling Unit + Shipping Container

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered: 6.22 New Construction, Pg 52

Applicant Presentation: Applicants Ken and Caroliegh Jouns of 4904 Florida Ave presented to the Commission that the driveway to the accessory dwelling unit will have to be addressed at a later date, because they do not currently have a design for it. They are wanting to build a garage on the bottom floor and an accessory dwelling unit on the second floor above the garage. In regards to the shipping container, it was there before they bought the house and they believe that it has been there for at least 20 years. They are planning to remove it once the garage gets built.

Community Response: No community comments or discussion.

Applicant Response to Community: No response needed.

Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote: The Commission began discussions by asking Staff why they were hearing about the shipping container and Staff informed them that because it was on the site plan it needed to be addressed. The Commission discussed making it a condition that the shipping container be removed instead of addressing it as part of the application. The Commission then discussed the actual realistic visibility from the street - some members don't think the public will be able to see very much of the building from the street given the location on the property.

Todd Morgan returned to the meeting at 10:23 a.m..

The Commission then discussed with the Applications about the windows and the type of windows that were proposed. They also discussed adding something about the driveway and parking into the motion so the Applicants don't have to come before the Commission again for it. The Commission had a few more questions about the roof and gable on the proposed building as well as the gutters.

- **Dana Moody** made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-20 - 4904 Florida Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- Porch post to be trimmed.
- Gutters to match the main house.
- Eaves to have open rafters.
- Vinyl-clad windows to be approved by Staff.
- Windows need to be double hung to match the main house.
- Allowance approved for parking pad off alley (gravel on concrete).
- Shipping container excluded from application.

Nathan Bird seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

HZ-24-33 - 4809 St. Elmo Ave. - Application Withdrawn

Applicant requested to withdraw their Application.

HZ-24-38 - 1506 W. 54th St.. - Exterior Rehabilitation

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered: 6.6 Decks, Pg 38, 6.9 Driveways & Paving, Pg 41, 6.24 Porches, Porch Columns, & Railings, Pg 59, 6.41 Windows, Pg 74

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Keith Owens from RiverCity Renovations representing the owners of 1506 W 54th St. presented to the Commission that they are wanting to rejuvenate the decorative features and make it look better. They stated that on the front porch, they need to replace the columns, because they are damaged and in rough shape. In the rear of the house, the Application stated that they want to make it appear more seamless with the addition that was added previously. They are considering removing the windows and adding a french door or a sliding door. They want to make the siding match and remove the aluminum windows from the addition and close it in. The Application then spoke on the plan for the side of the house. They are planning to install a new door that is currently on sight as well as replace the stained glass that is in the door. The Applicant would like to remove all the fencing (wood in the front and chain link on a couple sides of the property). On the other side of the house, the Application stated they just want to match the siding and windows to the rest of the house.

Community Response: No community comments or discussion.

Applicant Response to Community: No response needed.

Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote: The Commission asked the Applicant about the cast iron posts that are in the in front of the house and the plan for those. He stated that they were okay to leave them there, that they really wanted to remove the wooden fence that is in disrepair. The Commission then discussed the columns and how they would like to see a trim accent added since there was one in the original photos. Then they discussed the windows that the Applicant would like to remove and replace with a door. A couple of the Commission members do not want the windows removed, because then there is a major visual change. The Commission spent a little bit more time asking the Applicant clarifying questions about the rest of the proposed changes/updates.

- **Clif McCormick** made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-38 - 1506 W. 54th St., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:
 - Wrought iron front fence posts to remain.
 - Front porch columns to be replaced in kind with original columns, specifically noting column size and trim.
 - At the rear facade, any new windows to be vinyl clad or vinyl composite.
 - (Three) Double hung windows at the left of rear facade are to remain and may not be removed.
 - New deck to be Staff approved.
 - New door at existing right side "sunroom" to be Staff approved.
 - New driveway to be concrete.
 - Existing semi-circle porch extension to remain.
 - Existing chain link fence to be removed.

Matt McDonald seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

- HZ-24-50 - 117 Morningside Dr. - Skylights

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered: Roofs and Roofing, Pg 11, Windows and Doors, Pg 13

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Rachel Shannon of 1375 Jefferson St presented to the Commission that they are requesting to add some skylights in the roof to allow for some natural light into the soon-to-be finished attic space. They are going to be replacing the roof with in-kind materials and would like to add the skylights at the same time. They chose a black frame in hopes that it would blend in well with the roof.

Community Response: No community comments or discussion.

Applicant Response to Community: No response needed.

Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote: The Commission began their discussion by talking about the guidelines not saying anything about skylights specifically. The code speaks to no new windows or openings, but does not mention skylights. The Commission then discusses the visibility from the street as well as whether or not the skylights change the look of the house.

- **John Brennan** made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-50 - 117 Morningside Dr., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the Ferger Place Design Guidelines with no conditions.

Clif McCormick seconded the motion.

Roll Call Vote:

Skip Pond: No

Matt McDonald: No

Nathan Bird: Yes

John Brennan: No

Clif McCormick: Yes

Todd Morgan: Yes

Dana Moody: Yes

4 in favor - 3 opposed - **The motion carries 4-3.**

- HZ-24-55 - 4512 Alabama Ave. - Replace Front Windows & Rear Windows/Door

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered: 6.8 Doors, Pg 40, 6.41 Windows, Pg 74

Applicant Presentation: Applicant Anna Turner of 4512 Alabama Ave presented to the Commission that the appearance of the windows and doors may not look that bad, but they are rotted and the windows do not operate or lock. The Applicant also stated that the windows they are proposing to add are the same style as the neighbors and they want to keep the same style, but use different materials.

Community Response: No community comments or discussion.

Applicant Response to Community: No response needed.

Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote: The Commission discussed with the Applicant that it has always been the position of the Commission, as well as outlined very specifically in the guidelines, that the windows be repaired unless they are obviously damaged beyond repair. The Commission stated that some of the windows could potentially be replaced, but it appears that they could be repaired. They then discussed the replacement of the doors and the Applicant stated that the door that is there is not the original door. The Commission also pointed out that it is at the back of the home.

- **John Brennan** made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-55 - 4512 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:

- Window replacement is denied.

- Rear door replacement is approved as submitted.

Matt McDonald seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0. (Stated for the record that cedar shingle fringe can be replaced in kind is approved)

- HZ-24-56 - 1402 W. 55th St. - New Construction

Staff Presentation: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline presented the report to the Commission.

Relevant Guidelines Covered: 6.22 New Construction, Pg 52, 6.9 Driveways and Paving, Pg 41

Applicant Presentation: Applicants Jesus Lopez and Francarco P of 1402 W. 55th St. presented to the Commission their design for new construction and informed the Commission that they are waiting on an engineer to finalize how tall the foundation needs to be since the build will be in a floodplain. They also stated that the plans are drawn the way they are due to the lot shape and the required setbacks. The Applicants informed the Commission that they are using all the space that would have been attic as living space so that makes the proposed house a story and a half. They also stated that there will be a trim along the base of the house all the way around.

Community Response: No community comments or discussion.

Applicant Response to Community: No response needed.

Commission Discussion, Motion, and Vote: The Commission acknowledged the challenge of designing and building on a difficult lot. They stated they were concerned about the height of the house in comparison to the neighboring houses and also concerned not knowing for sure what the foundation height would ultimately be, due to not having the engineer's report about the floodplain. The Application stated that the engineer did give them some options for drainage that would help to keep from having to adjust the foundation height. The Commission then discussed the parking and had some siding concerns/questions.

- **Nathan Bird** made a motion to **APPROVE** case #: HZ-24-56 - 1402 W. 55th St., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 101-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, with the following conditions:
 - Foundation to be brick, no more than 4 feet in height.
 - Porch depth less than 6 feet not intended to set a precedent.

John Brennan seconded the motion.

All in favor. The motion carries 7-0.

Final Information/Staff Updates

Next Meeting Date: July 18th, 2024 (Application deadline is June 21st, 2024 at 4pm).

Historic Guidelines Update: Historic Preservation Planner Cassie Cline has a meeting planned with the consultant that is working with Staff on the updates. The draft of the update is proposed to be completed in November 2024 and then edits will be proposed and made. The final step is to go before the City Council for approval.

Dana Moody motioned to adjourn the meeting.

Todd Morgan seconded the motion.

All in favor.

Meeting was adjourned at 12:02 p.m..



Skip Pond, Chair

7/18/2024

Date



Shelby Ogle, Admin

7/18/24

Date

