

# Meeting Minutes

July 20, 2023

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on July 20<sup>th</sup>, 2023, at 9:30 A.M. in conference room 1A of the Development Resource Center. Chair Skip Pond called the meeting to order, Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Skip Pond explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

**Members Present:** Matt McDonald, Skip Pond, John Brennan, Clif McCormick, Leanne Kinney, Todd Morgan, Dana Moody, Piper Stromatt, Nathan Bird

**Members Absent:** N/A

**Staff Members Present:** Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer, Administrative Support Assistant II Andrew Pinion, Code Enforcement Inspector 2 Levi Witt City, Attorney Andrew Trundle

**Applicants Present:** Dylan Fuller, Andy Flanigan, Todd Ramsey, Kathryn Finerty

**Approval of Minutes:** Yes

## Old Business:

Case #HZ-23-52 1606 West 51<sup>st</sup> St. – Revised submittal

### Project Description:

The project scope for the existing 1,150 sf home, is an approximately 450 sf new addition with a back deck, and a new detached garage with accessory dwelling unit. Current garage will be demolished. Other exterior improvements include changing the metal front porch columns to wood, extending the gravel driveway and adding a privacy fence around the back half of the property.

**The Applicant Nate Paulk (1606 West 51<sup>st</sup> St.) has applied for the following:**

Rear addition and outbuilding

### Staff Comments:

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee regarding the CSAS school.

**Guidelines Covered:**

- 6.9 Driveways and Paving: Page 41
- 6.25 Porches, Porch Columns and Railings Page 59
- 6.23 New Construction: outbuildings Page 57
- 6.7 Demolition Page 39
- 6.1 Additions Page 33
- 6.6 Decks Page 38
- 6.11 Fences Page 44

**Comments from the community:**

Architect Dylan Fuller (1805 W 38<sup>th</sup> St.) spoke in greater detail and answered questions from the committee regarding the updated modifications.

The applicant Nate Paulk (1606 West 51<sup>st</sup> St.) spoke in greater detail and answered questions from the committee regarding the updated modifications.

Email messages from Brent O’Keefe (1609 W 51<sup>st</sup> St.), Ben & Ashley Baldwin (5015 St. Elmo Ave.), and Stephanie Downer Brewer (1608 W 51<sup>st</sup> St.) were acknowledged as supporting the modifications on the property.

Female (1805 W 38<sup>th</sup> St.) spoke in greater detail and answered questions from the committee regarding the updated modifications.

**Discussion:**

**A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Dana Moody made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-52, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions including:**

- **6” x 6” square wood columns at porch**
- **Windows need to be compatible with existing windows (double-hung)**

**Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.**

Case #HZ-23-64 4513 Virginia Ave. – Motion to Reconsider COA

Applicant had already replaced the windows on the property when telling the committee he had not. Chairman Pond did point out the applicant had perjured themselves.

**A discussion was had between the commission members and City Attorney Andrew Trundle. Dana Moody made a motion to reconsider Case HZ-23-64 at August CHZC meeting, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines.**

Matt McDonald seconded the motion to reconsider. All in favor, the motion carried to rehear.

### **New Business:**

- June Staff Reviews

Melissa Mortimer presented the staff reviews for June to the Commission:

- 1. HZ-23-72: 4617 Alabama Ave** Rear parking pad
- 2. Hz-23-74: 5506 Beulah Ave**
- 3. HZ-23-75: 955 Vine Street** in-kind replacement of garage roof from fallen tree
- 4. HZ-23-76: 510 Fortwood Place** in-kind repairs of damaged corbels and gutters.
- 5. Hz-23-77: 4710 St. Elmo Ave.** Roof replacement
- 6. Hz-23-78: 863 Oak Street** in-kind balcony balustrade replacement
- 7. HZ-23-79: 808 Vine Street** Removal of damaged tree
- 8. HZ-23-83: 118 Morningside Dr.** Damaged fence replacement
- 9. HZ-23-87: 4701 St. Elmo Ave.** Renewal of COA HZ-21-163

### Cases #HLM-23-1 – 865 E 3rd St –Historic Landmark Resolution

Counsel member Todd Morgan has recused himself from this case as he is the applicant.

### **Project Description:**

The Applicant Todd Morgan has applied for the following:

- Historic Landmark resolution for CSAS

### **Staff Comments:**

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee regarding the history and guidelines for CSAS.

### **Guidelines Covered:**

10.2 Historic Zoning, Landmark designations

**Comments from the community:**

Todd Morgan 1400 Market St.- spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

Bea Lurie 830 Vine St. - spoke about the project and is in favor of the resolution.

Rachel Shannon 700 Snow St. - spoke about the project and is in favor of the resolution.

Rebecca Marr - Fair Oak St. - spoke about the project and is in favor of the resolution.

Brian Shannon 700 Snow St. - spoke about the project and is in favor of the resolution.

James Hunt 545 Mountain Circle (McDonald, TN) - spoke about the project and is in favor of the resolution.

Emails from Pat L Smith 8499 Cherrybark Ln., Greta Bain 10550 Royal Andrews Drive Conroe, TX, and Erica Chapman 8 Oliphant Ave, Dobbs Ferry, NY. in favor of the resolution.

**Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-59 15020 W 48<sup>th</sup> St, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the following resolution:**

**A draft resolution presented to the commission on this day, except with the line “Whereas the gym, stadium, and other site elements are important to the context of the property as a school,” stricken and also subject to the report that was compiled by the applicant.**

**Nathan Bird seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.**

**Todd Morgan entered the meeting, and Nathan Bird left.**

Case #HZ-23-33 – 4500 Alabama Ave. – Alterations from COA HZ-21-155

**Project Description:**

The Applicant Tristan Rasey has the following:

- Reviewing changes to COA HZ-21-155
- Back deck alterations.

**Staff Comments:**

Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee.

**Comments from the community:**

Applicant Tristan Ramsey 4500 Alabama Ave. - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission. He believes there was confusion in the illustrations and the drawings.

**Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Cliff McCormick made a motion to approve Case Case #HZ-23-33 – 4500 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:**

- **Rear deck to be stained to match the front porch column.**

**Dana Moody seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.**

Case #HZ-23-74 – 5506 Beulah Ave – Patio and Pergola

**Project Description:**

The Applicant Kathryn Finerty has applied for the following.

- New construction of a patio and pergola.

**Comments from the community:**

Applicant Kathryn Finerty 5506 Buelah Ave. - spoke about the project and explained it in further detail to the Commission.

**Discussion: A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. Todd Morgan made a motion to approve Case HZ-23-74 5506 Beulah Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval with no conditions. Piper Stromatt seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.**

Case #HZ-23-80 – 4202 Alabama Ave. – New construction

**Project Description:**

The Applicant Andy Flanagan 2531 York Rd (Nolensville, TN) has applied for the following:

- New Construction at 4202 Alabama Ave.

**Staff Comments:** Historic Preservation Planner Melissa Mortimer presented the report to the committee outlining the plans that were submitted.

**Relevant Guidelines Covered:**

6.9 Driveways and Paving: Page 41

6.22 New Construction: Page 52

**Comments from the community:**

Applicant Andy Flannigan - spoke about the project and explained in further detail to the Commission.

**Discussion:** A discussion was had between the commission members and applicant. John Brennan made a motion to approve Case Case #HZ-23-33 – 4500 Alabama Ave., as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article 2, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Saint Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to the following conditions:

- Driveway to be full concrete from the alley to the garage door
- Windows to have simulated divided lites and specific window selection to meet staff approval
- Diagonal panels on both side elevations to be deleted
- Diagonal panel on front elevation to be composed of brick
- Front porch columns and brackets to be of matching material either wood or fiber cement
- Windows on lap sided elevations to have a 1" x 4" trim surround
- Windows on brick sided elevations to have brickmould surround.

Cliff McCormick seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was carried to approve.

Matt McDonald left the meeting before the vote took place.

**Other Business:** None.

Todd Morgan made a motion to adjourn the meeting.

 8/17/2003